Pakistan: Revitalizing Health Services in KP (P126426)

SOUTH ASIA | Pakistan | Health, Nutrition & Population Global Practice |
Recipient Executed Activities | Emergency Recovery Loan | FY 2012 | Seq No: 9 | ARCHIVED on 11-Dec-2015 | ISR21526 |
Implementing Agencies: Department of Health, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Key Dates

**Key Project Dates**

- **Bank Approval Date:** 12-Apr-2012
- **Effectiveness Date:** 12-Apr-2012
- **Planned Mid Term Review Date:** 09-Apr-2013
- **Actual Mid-Term Review Date:** 09-Apr-2013
- **Original Closing Date:** 30-Jun-2015
- **Revised Closing Date:** 12-Dec-2015

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)

Project development objective: The project development objective (PDO) is to improve the availability, accessibility and delivery of primary and secondary health care services at the district level.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?

No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Cost (US$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Component 1: Revitalizing health care services. (MDTF US$ 8.2 million &amp; GoKP US$ 15.0 million)</td>
<td>$8.20 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Component 3: Establish and operationalise a robust monitoring and evaluation system at district and provincial level. (MDTF US$ 2.0 million)</td>
<td>$2.00 M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

12/11/2015
The project had been in problem status for 30 months due to extensive implementation delays especially in the procurement process of the six district management contracts. The project was restructured in June 2014. The overall project objective remains the same but the scope of work has decreased due to the limited time available for implementation, one year of the original three years planned. The change in the administrative arrangements had led to some positive results as five out of the six district contracts were signed, (the firm selected for the sixth district declined). There is a visible effect of the project in the district facilities, with the ability to mobilize additional staff on short notice and provision of requisite medicines the working of the facilities has improved considerably. The Government of KP is considering extending this model of service delivery to other districts in the province and the modalities are being worked out.

One of the important aspects has been the unnecessary delays in payments to the contractors and the lack of support from the health department in implementation of project activities, although recently some support has been forthcoming from the Directorate General Office in field supervision and technical aspects of various programs. The support from the District Administration has been outstanding in District Torghar, Lower Dir, Battagram and Bunair, which has helped the teams resolve some issues with the staff and enable smooth functioning of the project. The lack of focus on contract management at the PMU has resulted in very slow feedback on strategic issues and communications can be improved to address the issue. The restructuring of the project led to positive progress; however, the issues regarding financial flow and monitoring have not been sorted out, and the need to effectively manage the contracts and community expectations has not been fulfilled. Delays in government releases have adversely affected the project and are now starting to impact service delivery. The Bank will closely monitor the progress of the project and actions taken to streamline the management. The support to continue the project will be reconsidered if the KP government submits an application for the second round of MDTF financing.
Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Social</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results

Project Development Objective Indicators

► People with access to a basic package of health, nutrition, or reproductive health services (number) (Number, Core)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>3216585.00</td>
<td>3816585.00</td>
<td>3956119.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Oct-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► Percent of children with Severe Acute Malnutrition provided adequate nutrition services (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
Nutrition services are being provided in two districts at present.
### Percent of births attended by skilled health personnel (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>24.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
The numbers are for institutional delivery in the public sector and thus are an under reporting of the actual achievement.

### Contraceptive prevalence rate (any modern method,) (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>14.30</td>
<td>15.00</td>
<td>15.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
The numbers are for institutional service delivery only.

### Community satisfaction with health care services delivery by public sector (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>38.00</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>45.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Comments

**Intermediate Results Indicators**
### Number of districts contracted out for management of services (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Health personnel receiving training (number) (Number, Core)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1365.00</td>
<td>1365.00</td>
<td>1200.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Percentage of Hubs established and assessed as fully functioning by DoH (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Health Facility Utilization Rate: Visits per person per year (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
## HFUR: by Gender (Male) (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## HFUR: Female (Percentage, Custom Supplement)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Health facilities constructed, renovated, and/or equipped (number) (Number, Core)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>126.00</td>
<td>126.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2012</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## # of DHQ hospitals refurbished (Number, Custom Breakdown)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Health facilities adequately refurbished (Number, Custom Breakdown)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>52.00</td>
<td>52.00</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Timely disbursement of funds to a consultant/NGO implementing contracting out (Days, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>25.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Biannual meetings held for Provincial Steering Committee (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2012</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>30-Apr-2015</td>
<td>31-Dec-2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Number of Health facilities submitting monthly reports on time to district (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>50.00</td>
<td>72.00</td>
<td>90.00</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Establishment within two months from the contract date and operationalization of District Health Management Team (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Overall Comments

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P126426</td>
<td>TF-11062</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>10.20</td>
<td>5.80</td>
<td>5.85</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

Level 2 Approved on 10-Jun-2014, Level 2 Approved on 29-Jun-2015

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.